TOURISM POLICY DEVELOPMENT AND IMPLEMENTATION IN THE EASTERN CAPE PROVINCE, SOUTH AFRICA: DOES LOCAL STAKEHOLDER INVOLVEMENT COUNT?

1 Monwabisi Silwana, Department of Tourism and Events Management, Faculty of Business & Management, Cape Peninsular University of Technology, Cape Town, South Africa
2 Cynthia Nokubonga Dube, Department of Tourism and Events Management, Faculty of Business & Management Science, Cape Peninsula University of Technology, South Africa

*Corresponding author E-mail: monwabisisilwana1@gmail.com, DUBEC@cput.ac.za
1 ORCID ID: 0000-0001-7363-0503
2 ORCID ID: 0000-0002-1150-3266

ARTICLE INFO

Review Scientific Paper
Received: 16.08.2022
Revised: 28.10.2022
Accepted: 25.11.2022

DOI 10.7251/ACE2237143M
UDC 338.486.1.02:330.35(680)

Keywords: stakeholder, policies, stakeholder theory, tourism planning
JEL Classification: L8

ABSTRACT

Municipalities are at the lowest level of Government, and it is where the actual implementation of tourism policies takes place. District municipalities and communities globally often face poorly planned development projects resulting from inefficient and ineffective policy and planning implementation. One of the reasons for this is that there is, at times, a lack of participation by key stakeholders. The success of tourism development policies and their implementation rests on the involvement of all relevant stakeholders. This study adopted a qualitative research approach whereby purposive and snowball sampling methods were used to identify the research sample from the research population. The research population included the district municipality staff, regional and local tourism organisations, also known as tourism forums, tourism development agencies, and the rural planning and economic development departments. Consequently, fourteen (14) semi-structured interviews were conducted with key stakeholders from the district municipality, local municipalities, tourism organisations and Eastern Cape Parks Tourism Agency. A thematic analysis technique was used to analyse the data. This study focused on stakeholder involvement in the development and implementation of tourism policies in the O.R Tambo District Municipality (ORTDM). The key findings from the study revealed that there is a lack of stakeholder collaboration in development and the implementation of tourism-related policies in ORTDM.

© 2022 ACE. All rights reserved

http://www.ae.ef.unibl.org/
1. INTRODUCTION

Despite the novel coronavirus (COVID-19), which led the world to a standstill in the first quarter of 2020, Gössling, Scott & Hall (2020) state that tourism has been the fastest-growing sector worldwide for decades and its growth can be traced back after the end of the Second World War. Sharpley and Telfer (2015) state that several publications from governments and statistics show a growth of tourism’s contribution to the global economy. The growing curiosity and eagerness to learn may be one of the many reasons tourism has become one of the fastest-growing sectors globally. Earle (2008) describes tourism as an economic activity whose aim is to find ways to reduce poverty, create employment and entrepreneurship opportunities in communities. Apart from the classifications associated with the term “tourism”, the most widely recognised definition is by the United Nations World Tourism Organisation (UNWTO), which states that tourism is “the activities of persons travelling to and staying in places outside their usual environment for not more than one consecutive year for leisure, business and other purposes” (UNWTO, 2008, p. 9). President Cyril Ramaphosa revealed that tourism is growing, creating more than 700 000 employment opportunities (State of the Nation Address [SONA], 2018). Therefore, a plan of action is required to ensure that the tourism industry is properly sustainable and kept for future generations. Policies play an essential role in the tourism industry, and they have an influence on industry operations and how legislation is drafted.

Hatipoglu Alvarez & Ertuna (2016, p. 308) state that several stakeholders are involved in tourism, including communities, tourists as leisure seekers, and destinations. With the mandate of developing, implementing, and regulating policies, the government is also among the significant tourism stakeholders. Tourism development policies play a fundamental role in the tourism realm as they serve as a blueprint for developing the tourism industry for national, regional, district and local municipalities. Furthermore, a proper tourism development policy is vital to provide the relevant tourism stakeholders and authorities with guidance on implementing and monitoring the policy. Additionally, Birendra, Dhungana and Dangi (2021), state that destinations without an appropriate tourism policy can struggle to develop the area to attract more visitors as there is no road map to follow. However, creating a policy alone does not yield results for the tourism industry because the policy should be successfully implemented. The policy’s applicability needs to be monitored, and evaluation also put in place to create room for possible changes. A good policy should never be inflexible for example; the National Tourism Sector Strategy (NTSS), the National Development Plan (NDP) and the New Growth Path (NGP), to mention a few,
are flexible policies, and they have a direct and indirect role in the development of tourism in South Africa.

Earlier researchers such as Pebane (2016), Solomons (2016), Bassadien (2017), Bhandari (2019) and Odounga Othy (2020) stressed the significance of stakeholders’ involvement in the development and implementation of tourism policies. But, Waligo, Clarke & Hawkins (2013, p. 343) acknowledged that stakeholders play an important role through their involvement in facilitating the implementation of sustainable tourism. Hence several scholars (Freeman, 1984; Waligo, Clarke & Hawkins, 2013; Ntloko, 2016) discussed the importance of the stakeholder theory and multi-stakeholder framework in tourism planning. Bhandary (2019) cited the significance of policy development in the tourism industry, and highlighted the role of development discourse in a country’s tourism policy. What is unknown from the earlier studies is the impact of involving local tourism stakeholders in the development and implementation of tourism-related policies. This study, therefore, aimed at ascertaining the significance of involving different stakeholders in tourism policy development and implementation in the ORTDM.

2. THEORATICAL FRAMEWORK

According to Lester (2005, p. 459), theoretical frameworks are essential in assisting the researcher in structuring the research problem, theorizing and planning research studies. Theoretical framework helped to guide the entire study. The perspective on the current paper framework is based on planning concepts (basic steps and levels of planning) and stakeholder process in planning (stakeholder involvement and roles in tourism planning and development context). Tourism development may be a complex matter, and it requires the participation of various stakeholders in tourism policy planning. Therefore, a stakeholder theory was used in the context of this research.

The stakeholder theory can be traced back from Freeman (1984), who stated that the stakeholder theory argues that organisations should create value for all players, not only for shareholders. Working together and producing value is at the heart of business and the stakeholder theory. The stakeholder theory is a business perspective that stresses the interconnected relationships that exist between the organisation and its customers, staff, suppliers, investors, and stakeholders and communities (Freeman, 1984; Friedman & Miles, 2006; Freeman, 2010; Baah et al., 2021). The stakeholder is used in this study because the tourism planning process in district municipalities requires input from different stakeholders. These
stakeholders include all those that will be directly and indirectly affected by the development and implementation of tourism policies. According to stakeholder theory, the objective of a firm is to create value for all stakeholders, not just shareholders (Stakeholder Map, n.d.). Figure 1 shows the different organisations that make up the stakeholder theory.

Figure 1: Stakeholder theory
Source: Freeman et al. (2018, p. 24)

The stakeholder theory is made up of primary and secondary stakeholders. Fassin (2012), seconded by Todd, Leask & Ensor (2017, p. 500), states that primary stakeholders are those that may affect or be affected by the organisation. Figure 1 above shows that investors, employees, customers, suppliers and communities are typical examples of primary stakeholders. Therefore, in the context of this study, primary stakeholders would be ORTDM itself and the Local Municipalities under the District Municipalities. There are also secondary stakeholders involved in development and implementation of tourism policies in ORTDM. Secondary stakeholders are the individuals or organisations who are not directly affected by company activities (Aaltonen & Kujala, 2010). Taking it further, Fliaster & Kolloch (2017), define secondary stakeholders as people or entities that do not engage in direct business transactions with the company or organisations. So, in this research study, secondary stakeholders would be the District Tourism Organisation (DTO), Local Tourism Organisations and Eastern Cape Parks Tourism Agency (ECPTA). Tourism planning requires different stakeholders to participate in the development and implementation process.
2.1. Tourism planning in district municipalities

There is a broad literature on public sector intervention in the tourism sector, and scholars should also direct attention towards a better understanding of the rationality, roles, and activities of this engagement in the tourism sector, particularly at the local government level (Shone, Simmons & Dalziel, 2016, p.2). This study notes this knowledge gap, and it aims to ascertain the involvement of different stakeholders in tourism policy development and implementation in the ORTDM.

The Municipal Structures Act No. 117 of 1998 provided a legislative framework for the joining and validation of municipalities under the constitution of South Africa (South African Local Government Association (SALGA, 2011, p. 4; Hofstetter, Bolding & van Koppen, 2020, p. 860). Pretorius and Schurink (2007, p. 25) credit the Municipal Systems Act No. 32 of 2000 for specifying the roles of district municipalities. These roles are well-defined and explained in the South African Constitution. South African Constitution (South Africa, 1996) endorsed by Al’Afghani, Kohlitz & Willetts (2019), states that municipalities have a right to rule, own their programs or initiatives, and manage local government affairs. However, all these must be subject to national and provincial legislation. Sperling, Hvelplund & Mathiesen (2011, p.1341) argued that the implementation of national policies and strategies are mainly distributed to municipalities. Thornhill (2008, p. 503) states that district municipalities are allowed to make and administer by-laws for effective administration. However, these by-laws must be aligned with national and provincial regulations. Section 151 (4) of the Constitution of the Republic of South Africa warns that a by-law that is inconsistent with national or provincial legislation is void (South African Constitution, Local Government, 1996).

Districts and local municipalities are government spheres in their own right. However, it is recommended that they apply cooperative governance principles (Morçöl & Wolf, 2010, p. 908; Herbig, 2019). Also, tourism planners in district municipalities should develop regulations that stand to the mandate of the municipality act, the republic constitution, and provincial tourism plans when undertaking local tourism planning and execution interventions (Irazábal, 2018, p. 88). Therefore, Bramwell (2011, p. 63) recommends coordinated efforts and stakeholder involvement in planning to avoid inconsistencies between tourism policies. The local government should make tourism plans and policies in collaboration with other local tourism stakeholders. Timothy (1999, p. 388) advocates local stakeholder involvement because it helps develop tourism policies relevant to local conditions. Liu and Wall (2006, p.168) and Bichler...
(2021) state that local tourism authorities have a better understanding of available tourism resources, workforce, and financial resources.

Rural municipalities, like the ORTDM, are well-known for their shortcomings in tourism development. Unlike urban metros with big budgets allocated to economic development, rural municipalities have limited funds (Nel & Rogerson, 2007, p. 9; Kulaba, 2019). Available resources only cater to service delivery and other basic needs (Jili & Mthethwa, 2016, p. 103). Therefore, district municipalities should plan and implement strategies that are key to the growth and development of the tourism sector (Reed, 1997, p. 568; Timothy, 1999; Kontsiwe & Visser, 2019, p. 1340). The key priority areas in district tourism policy that should be addressed are infrastructure development, crime prevention, zoning, community and local economic development. The general considerations on improving infrastructure should promote the improvement of telecommunications capacity to ensure connectivity in rural tourist destinations (Thacker et al., 2019, p. 27). Tourist signage is an essential part of tourism planning in district municipalities. Taking it further, Tirachini and Cats (2020, p.9) propose that there must be a link between both private and public transportation. Districts and local municipalities should develop regulations that govern the tourism sector, including the licensing of businesses to support independent tourist movements (De la Calle-Vaquero, Garcia-Hernandez & Mendoza de Miguel, 2021, p. 21). Safety is a precedent in destination planning at the district level. Therefore, to reduce arguments around safety and security, district municipalities should invest in building tourism safety programs (Imbeah & Bujdoso, 2018).

3. RESEARCH METHODS

In a theoretical position, qualitative studies are based on beliefs about the nature of reality or knowledge (Twining et al., 2017, p. 2). Ormston et al. (2014, p. 4) believe that qualitative research can be conducted to study individual experience and make sense of their shared reality. According to Maree (2016, p. 52) qualitative research is a naturalist system that focuses on natural settings where interactions occur. The qualitative research method is suitable for this study because this study seeks to find the answers to the involvement of tourism stakeholders in development and implementation of tourism-related policies in the area under investigation. The researcher included various tourism stakeholders who are part of tourism planning and policy development at the ORTDM. These individuals also participated as crucial informants for data collection.
3.1. Research participants

The research population in this study included the district municipality staff, regional and local tourism organisations, also known as tourism forums, tourism development agencies, rural planning, and economic development departments. According to Fox, Bayat & Ferreira (2007, p. 52), the research population is a group of individuals from whom the samples are taken for measurement. The Department of Cooperative Governance and Traditional Affairs (COGTA) was also part of the research population in this study. To sum up, Explorable (n.d.) describes the research population as an extensive collection of individuals who focus on a scientific query (Explorable, n.d.) and the sample (participants) of this study was selected from the research population. There are two types of sampling methods, namely, probability and non-probability techniques.

The probability technique uses its theory to generalise the research population. Maree (2016, p.197) mentions that the non-probability sampling technique does not make random selection of the research population. Due to limited financial resources and time constraints, the researcher chose a non-probability sampling method as a suitable technique for this study. Researchers should limit the use of a non-probability method, but when financial resources are limited and results are needed urgently, Maree (2016, p.197) recommends the non-probability sampling method. Due to limited budget and time constraints the researcher chose a non-probability method for this study. Purposive sampling and snowball sampling methods were used in this study to identify the research sample from the research population.

According to Etikan, Alkassim & Abubakar (2016, p.55), the snowball sampling method is a non-random technique that does not need underlying theories or a set number of participants. The starting point to apply this method was to contact the district tourism manager who helped to identify people in charge of tourism-related policies. This practice allowed the researcher to decide who should participate and what needs to be known. Welman and Kruger (1999, p.197) state that the technique, as mentioned above, helps identify individuals with the necessary expertise and information different to other groups. In addition to the previous statement, Maree (2016, p.198) notes that snowball sampling is proper when the research interest is interconnected. The above sampling methods serve as a direction to data collection and related groups such as local and district tourism officers, municipality tourism managers, Eastern Cape Tourism Agency (ECPTA), and district and local tourism organisations formed the study sample.
3.2. Data collection and analysis

One of the main characteristics to consider when conducting a qualitative study is that the researcher serves as a data collection instrument. In the context of this study, Maree (2016, p.311) notes that quantitative and qualitative approaches may differ in their research questions and data collection, but they can be applied to study the same research problem. This study only used the qualitative research method as the main problem that was investigated is stakeholder involvement in the development and implementation of tourism-related policies in ORTDM. The researcher viewed an in-depth understanding of the participants’ individual experiences about the matter under investigation. Therefore, interview guides were used as data collection instruments for this study. Wellman and Kruger (1999, p. 197) note that qualitative studies usually use interviews to identify important research variables.

Fourteen (14) semi-structured interviews were conducted on this study. Wengraf (2013, p.5) recommends semi-structured interviews because they help to guide the discussion and cover everything that needs to be covered. These interviews have helped the researcher understand opinions and emotions of respondents concerning their involvement in the development process and their concerns about the implementation of tourism related policies in the study area. Maree (2016, p. 205) further mentions that interviews are completed based on what the interviewee says. Due to COVID-19 pandemic, the semi-structured interviews were conducted through online platforms such as “Zoom” and “Microsoft teams”. The online platforms were merely used to adhere to health and safety protocols. The thematic analysis technique was used to analyse the data. The researcher used thematic analysis because it was recommended by Odounga Othy (2020, p.8), as the researcher describes it as “an independent qualitative descriptive approach”. This technique helped to identify and explore research themes from data collected from the participants (Braun & Clarke, 2006, p. 79). In this study, the researcher used thematic analysis to analyse data. The thematic analysis technique recognised the patterns within data, and themes emerged from the collected data and it became a set category for analysis (Fereday & MuirCochrane, 2006). Taking it further, Guest, MacQueen & Namey (2012) state that this analysis technique consists of reading through transcribed data, identifying common themes in the data, coding the themes, and interpreting their structure and content.
4. RESULTS AND DISCUSSIONS

There are different stakeholders involved in development and in the implementation of tourism policies. This study, therefore, aimed at ascertaining the significance of involving different stakeholders in tourism policy development and implementation in the ORTDM. Therefore, Table 1 below depicts the demographic profile of those who participated in this study as respondents from different organisations which they represented:

Table 1: Participants’ demographic profile

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Organisation</th>
<th>Position</th>
<th>Years in service</th>
<th>Education</th>
<th>Name of qualification</th>
<th>Gender</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Tourism Organisation (R1)</td>
<td>Chairperson</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>Matric</td>
<td>Matric</td>
<td>Male</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Local Municipality (R2)</td>
<td>Manager</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>Diploma and National Certificates</td>
<td>Diploma in Public Administration, Certificate in Small Business Management and Certificate in LED</td>
<td>Male</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Local Municipality (R3)</td>
<td>Deputy Director</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>Honors Degree</td>
<td>Development Studies</td>
<td>Male</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Tourism Organisation (R4)</td>
<td>Chairperson</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>Degree</td>
<td>Business management</td>
<td>Female</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Local Municipality (R6)</td>
<td>Officer</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>Diploma</td>
<td>Tourism Management</td>
<td>Male</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Local Municipality (R6)</td>
<td>Manager</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>Master’s Degree</td>
<td>Tourism Management</td>
<td>Female</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Tourism Organisation (R8)</td>
<td>Chairperson</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>Degree</td>
<td>Business Management</td>
<td>Male</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Local Municipality (R9)</td>
<td>Officer</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>Degree</td>
<td>Tourism Management</td>
<td>Female</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Tourism Agency (R10)</td>
<td>Manager</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>Degree</td>
<td>Tourism Management</td>
<td>Female</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Local Municipality (R11)</td>
<td>Officer</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>Degree</td>
<td>Tourism Management</td>
<td>Female</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Tourism Organisation (R12)</td>
<td>Chairperson</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>Bachelor’s degree</td>
<td>Association of Chartered Certified Accountant</td>
<td>Female</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>District Municipality (R13)</td>
<td>Officer</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>Diploma</td>
<td>Tourism Management</td>
<td>Female</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>District Municipality (R14)</td>
<td>Manager</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>Diploma</td>
<td>Tourism Management</td>
<td>Female</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Source: Researcher’s creation
Tourism planning and development requires a combined effort from different stakeholders who represent the private and public sectors (Jamal & Getz, 1995, p. 188). Wan (2013, p. 165) further suggests that tourism planning and development requires a census consultation, and all tourism stakeholders should be informed about development decisions. Table 1 above shows a wide variety of stakeholders that participated in this study. The number of years in their respective roles (policy development and implementation), the level of education, and the different positions that they hold in their organisations are shown on the above table. It is also important to note that all participants hold some form of education from matric to degrees in tourism and other related fields. The fact that thirteen of the fourteen participants have experience of at least three years may mean that they have sufficient knowledge about how policy is developed and implemented within the organisations.

It is important to note that there are different stakeholders involved in tourism development and the implementation of tourism policies. Therefore, the following section discusses findings related to the involvement of stakeholders in tourism development and implementation of tourism policies.

4.1. Stakeholder involvement in tourism policy development and implementation

According to Makuzva (2018, p.1) tourism is a multifaceted industry with many elements combined to offer saleable tourism products. Consequently, there are many issues that tourism stakeholders need to consider in the development process and prior in policy decisions (Yuksel, Bramwell & Yuksel, 1999, p. 354; Thetsane, 2019). Both internal and external factors are most likely to impact negatively or positively when policies are implemented (Somers & Nelson, 2001, p. 5; Saint Akadiri, Alola & Akadiri, 2019, p. 428). Boukas and Ziakas (2016, p. 48), state that internal matters such as coordination among tourism stakeholders play an essential part in tourism policy development. Socio-economic and political environment are external factors that should be considered when drafting tourism policies. Participants have concerns about lack of stakeholder engagement and poor implementation of tourism policies from the research findings.

4.2. Lack of stakeholder collaboration

The view of participants regarding stakeholders and the collaboration between the tourism agency, district, and local municipalities as well as tourism organisations to build solid relationships to the ORTDM tourism policy development shows
how this concept is widely misunderstood or simply unknown. Seven participants (R1, R4, R7, R8, R10, R12 and R14), mentioned that there is a need for tourism organisations to collaborate with local municipalities. The aforementioned participants suggested that politicians and municipality must support the Small Micro Medium Enterprise (SMME) in order to improve and uplift the tourism standards in the ORTDM. The success in tourism planning and stakeholder collaboration will undoubtedly positively impact the development of the tourism and hospitality sectors for the district municipality (ORTDM) and South Africa. However, the view is contradicted in the response that was received from participant one (R1) who claimed that the “Eastern Cape the adventure province” slogan was developed by people who did not come from the province and they kept mentioning bungee jumping, located in Western Cape in Bloukrans River Bridge (Tsitsikamma National Park) as a referencing point of adventure tourism. Members of the tourism organisation, like R1 and R2, mentioned that people did not know what adventure was, and tourism planners used only bungee jumping as a reference point, which raises a question about stakeholder collaboration and engagement of stakeholders in the planning of tourism strategies. Swarbrooke et al. (2003:4), define adventure tourism as means of exploring, and it involves experiencing tourist destinations by participating in physical activities such as hiking, bungee jumping, snorkelling, skydiving, and much more. Shahi (2017, p. 3), further states that adventure tourism attracts adrenaline junkies and those who seek thrills. 

There is nothing wrong with tourism destination-planners being inspired and studying what other provinces or destinations are doing in destination-marketing. However, when developing a marketing strategy, comprehensive consulting with others is required to ensure that they understand the marketing strategy. All 14 participants agreed that stakeholder collaboration empowers the tourism industry, tourism organisations, tourism associations and local municipalities, together with the involvement of the district tourism department. The views of respondents R1 and R8 were that the provincial government and the ECPTA invite people from outside to develop tourism marketing strategies without collaborating with local tourism stakeholders. R8 further mentioned the following:

…so basically, the strategy was developed by visitors, people who did not come from here, as a matter of fact, it was never taken off and people do not buy into it here. Not involving role-players in tourism planning and expecting them to act is like going to a battleground with a squad that has never trained together.
Planning is not an island; it is essential to involve every stakeholder in planning as they are affected by tourism plans and policies. If all parties are involved in planning and are consulted prior to making policy decisions, they are most likely to support tourism development initiatives. The lack of buy-in on the “Eastern Cape, the adventure province” results from a lack of consultation; otherwise, everyone in ORTDM would have understood the strategic direction and supported the marketing initiative. Additionally, marketing strategies should be developed based on features and available tourism products at the destination. Tour operators are essential to destination development and marketing, therefore, the DTO needs to establish an operator to create tourism packages for the ORTDM region.

Municipalities are political institutions and all fund allocations related to tourism development need council (political structure) approval (Roberts, 2008:527). Haughton and Rybář (2008:240) further mention that all policy directions are derived from political manifestos or resolutions of a particular political party. With political support from the district municipality and provincial government, tourism can thrive in the ORTDM. Respondents R1, R5 and R8 mentioned that there is still tension in political structures in the EC, hence slow progress in tourism for the ORTDM region in question. R1 further mentioned that:

The Eastern Cape was broken into two parts (Ciskei and Transkei) by the apartheid government. That political rift hasn’t been healed yet. Up until we get people who look beyond that…and until we use the Constitution and make this a selfless exercise, we are not going to move beyond that…

Party politics was one of the issues that participants (R1, R2, R3, R4, R7, R8, R10, R12 and R14) were concerned about. Whether one likes it or not, politics has an impact on tourism that is developed and planned. Politics is part of the external environment but it somehow influences the way tourism policies are drafted. Before the new South African political dispensation in 1994, the Eastern Cape Province consisted of the Transkei, which forms part of the wild coast, the ORTDM on the eastern part and Ciskei. When considered from a tourism development perspective, the Ciskei has always had better infrastructure compared to the former Transkei. The Tourism Grading Council and the ECPTA head offices are in East London, while the provincial legislature resides in King Williams Town. Some participants feel that they should have their own grading facilities instead of having someone from East London to grade their facilities. They also mentioned that they do not feel important enough to have better resources and facilities like other regions.
Perhaps when too many tourism stakeholders are at the local and regional level, tourism planners tend to waste time and effort consulting before anything is done (Devine et al., 2011:527). Tourism stakeholders should find a common interest to develop and grow tourism, then communicate with all departments involved in running tourism. All stakeholders should work towards a common purpose while aiming to attain their objectives. It is the government’s role to ensure that they manage tourism effectively and support small businesses to ensure that their strategic goals are attained. However, this understanding is contrary to the response received from a representative (R1) who claimed that there are business opportunities that could lead to tourism growth. Still, they do not receive financial support from the municipality:

The municipality has been taught to milk cows, not to feed cows. Local tourism operators need the approval of the law and funding to take advantage of business opportunities.

The respondent’s view was that the district municipality did not create an enabling policy environment for tourism businesses to operate, which results from poor tourism planning. Also, the statement mentioned earlier by the respondent (R1) indicates that the municipality cannot assist the private sector with financial support (funding) to capitalise on business opportunities. In response to the above claim, a respondent (R3) from the district municipality mentioned that tourism receives partial political support and has a limited budget to implement tourism policies. Therefore, the district municipality needs to collaborate with members of the DTO and the communities to lobby for political support in tourism.

There are issues surrounding tourism awareness and experiencing tourism consultancy was a hot topic amongst participants. Some participants (R4, R7 & R8) believe that there is an issue of hiring people with limited experience in tourism development at the district municipality. Many of the participants (R1, R4, R7, R8 & R12) from the tourism organisations stressed the issue of inexperienced tourism personnel who attend travel and trade shows just to take pictures. There is a need for the municipality to invite some of the members of the tourism organisations to attend travel shows to showcase their offerings and learn from other destinations. Some issues need urgent attention; for example, a participant (R14) from the district municipality highlighted the following matters with regards to relations between tourism stakeholders (government and tourism organisations) in the ORTDM:

There is little or no integration between government spheres. There is competition between members of the forum that hinder tourism development. Some of the members of the association are
competing for tenders. The private sector usually participates in the Tourism fora because of the length of the meetings.

There is a need to establish good relationships between municipality employees and the members of the tourism associations. Tourism policy development and planning is not an island; therefore, collaboration amongst role-players is necessary to ensure that each stakeholder understands their role in tourism. Good relations build trust and trust is a solid foundation for a healthier working relationship between tourism stakeholders. When everyone is happy about their role, they work even harder to achieve both team and individual goals to ensure the implementation of tourism policies in the ORTDM.

4.3. Poor implementation of tourism policies

There is a perception that the district and its local municipalities are not effective in implementing tourism policies. Poor implementation of tourism plans negatively impacts destination development and growth (Ashley et al., 2001; Kebete & Wondirad, 2019). For example, if there is a delay in the installation of electricity, the accommodation hospitality sector is most likely to suffer from the consequences. Brokaj (2014, p. 105) recommends that the existing gap between ideology and practice is a significant step to converting the concept of tourism plans into daily practice. The issue of poor implementation of tourism strategies is one of the essential themes predominantly emphasised by most (R1, R2, R3, R5, R6, R9 & R11, R12 & R14) participants.

Poor implementation of tourism strategies can be perceived as a stumbling block to tourism development, which is why the above respondent (R5) calls for each stakeholder to perform their individual organisational tasks. Tourism policy is as good as it sounds but without execution or implementation, it is futile (Whitford & Ruhanen, 2010, p. 476). However, R12 believes that there is a lack of implementation and the respondent further made the following remarks:

There was a strategy about commercialisation that was developed in 2016 and launched in 2017. The tourism agency has been sitting on this strategy since 2017, they cannot deal with the workload so they must call on private operators to come and assist… There is a vast amount of land where the government has built tourism facilities but they are not working. Since then, they have allocated only three facilities to the private sector… and we have about ten reserves laying down, the government is not playing enough role to improve the tourism sector.
Based on the above claims, the commercialisation strategy was developed without a proper implementation plan. Inskeep (1991, p. 429) opined that tourism strategies must be prepared realistically to be implementable. There has been no coordination between the district municipality and the private sector. R8 further mentioned that there is still work on the relations between the district municipality and other tourism stakeholders. Tourism policy and implementation go hand in hand. Rodriguez et al. (2014, p. 79) further state that policy and implementation are two sides of the same coin. It is important to note that there are not enough resources to ensure that the desired plans are implemented and there are growing concerns and fears from the tourism organisation. Respondent R7 mentioned that:

…we have to constantly knock at the government doors and remind them about what they are supposed to do. But then again, if you keep pushing, you somehow become the enemy of the state and end up not getting invited when there are meetings and workshops relating to tourism businesses.

Once again, the statement above clearly indicates that some stakeholders are not satisfied with the way the government manages things in the ORTDM. All participants throughout the interviews kept mentioning that there are issues that make it difficult for the district municipality to implement tourism policies. Delays on land claims and allocations were also a dominant factor amongst participants. One respondent (R8) mentioned that the district municipality makes deals with foreign companies rather than local businesses. On the other hand, R5 claims that the Marine Protection Act (MPA) No. 27 of 2000 was designed to exclude black communities close to the coastline because:

The only act they are focusing on is the Marine Protection Act… which states that we are not allowed to build close to the coastline and houses must be located 5 km away from the coastline. However, white people build houses close to the coastline because they do EIA’s and build private cottages.

The ECPTA and the ORTDM should try to teach people who are in these remote areas about the value of the tourism sector. Transforming the tourism and hospitality industry is one of the pillars in the National Tourism Sector Strategy. Therefore, the ECPTA should encourage and help people to get the EIA so that they can remain on the coastline and have their own private establishments to employ other community members. One participant (R7) further makes the following assertions about corrupt activities between traditional leaders and the ECPTA:

http://www.ae.ef.unibl.org/
To get land, people bribe traditional leaders and get a piece of land, then go to ECPTA for EIA assessment approvals to build these private cottages. We are fighting big wars when it comes to corruption and implementation of policies and acts. The municipality has failed dismally. It is surprising that they are constantly developing new strategies but failing to implement what they have.

There is no substantive evidence to back the above claims, but if there are any wrongdoings, law enforcement agencies need to get involved and prevent this from happening. Some authors state that corruption is a criminal offence; whoever is involved in any illegal dealings should be arrested. South Africa has been rooted in corruption over the last couple of decades and citizens suffer from wrongdoings.

5. CONCLUSIONS

Participants were very optimistic about the tourism workshops organised by the ORTDM and other tourism role players. However, some were critical and unimpressed with how the district municipality facilitates and manages the tourism industry. Participants believe that tourism is not planned in an integrated manner; consequently, they fail to implement their policies. Therefore, the district municipality should lead the development process, and apply the stakeholder theory when it engages with different stakeholders (multi-stakeholder approach) involved in development, implementation and monitoring of tourism policies.

The multi-stakeholder model or approach is essential in the case of this study because Kannan (2018) states that it allows all stakeholders to be responsible and present in the tourism policy decision-making process. The multi-stakeholder approach can be defined as a policy objective of creating a culture of collaboration and inclusion in the tourism industry (George et al., 2007:1). These authors suggested that all role players should share knowledge that relates to the tourism sector so as to scatter the long-held perception that tourism is an exploiter of wealth where only the rich can benefit. The stakeholder theory can be achieved through representation from all tourism stakeholders and discussing their interests and pronouncing on policy decisions (for example, the tourism development process at the local level uses tourism forums and workshops to foster collaborations, networking and to improve business relationships between tourism stakeholders).

Furthermore, benefits can be achieved by collaborating with the district municipality, local municipalities, and tourism organisations to build solid
relations for tourism policy development. Stakeholder collaboration has a positive impact on the development of tourism and hospitality as an economic sector. In the light of the recent announcements such as the Tourism Sector Recovery Plan (TSRP) of 2020 by South African National Department of Tourism, there appears to be the need for a broader analysis of a multi-stakeholder approach in the tourism policy development process. Such investigation would allow the unpacking of the challenges involved and provide a continuous implementation basis for policy development at the lowest level of governance. In this way, a more integrated and sustainable tourism sector could be constructed in the ORTDM and the Eastern Cape more broadly. Future studies collaboratively focusing on tourism policy development would be beneficial to both economic development and the tourism industry.

ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

I would like to express my sincere gratitude and appreciation to my supervisor, Dr. Cynthia Nokubonga Dube, who guided and inspired me throughout this study; my family for their support; and the South African Department of Tourism with financial assistance channeled through the Cape Peninsula University of Technology.

Conflict of interests

Authors declare that the content of this paper represents their own unaided work and that this article has not previously been submitted to any publication for a review. Authors declare there is no conflict of interest.

REFERENCES


http://www.ae.ef.unibl.org/


http://www.ae.ef.unibl.org/


the 34th Annual Hawaii International Conference on System Sciences (pp. 1-10). Maui: IEEE Xplore. DOI:10.1109/HICSS.2001.927129


Thetsane, R. (2019). Local community participation in tourism development: The case of Katse villages in Lesotho. Athens Journal of Tourism, 6(2),123-140. DOI:10.30958/ajt.6-2-4


РАЗВОЈ И ИМПЛЕМЕНТАЦИЈА ТУРИСТИЧКЕ ПОЛИТИКЕ У ПРОВИНЦИЈИ ИСТОЧНИ КЕЈП, ЈУЖНОАФРИЧКА РЕПУБЛИКА: ДА ЛИ СЕ РАЧУНА УКЉУЧИВАЊЕ ЛОКАЛНИХ СТЕЈКХОЛДЕРА?

1 Монвабиси Силвана, Одсјек за туризам и менаџмент догађаја, Факултет за бизнис и менаџмент, Технолошки универзитет у Кејптауну, Кејптаун, Ју ђноафричка Република
2 Синтија Нокубонга Дјуб, Одсјек за туризам и управљање догађајима, Факултет за бизнис и менаџмент, Технолошки универзитет у Кејптауну, Кејптаун, Ју ђноафричка Република

САЖЕТАК

Општине су на најнижем нивоу власти и ту се одвија стварна имплементација туристичке политике. Општине и заједнице у дистрикту на глобалном нивоу често се суочавају са лошом планирањим развојним пројектима који су резултат и неефикасне имплементације политике и планирања. Један од разлога јeste и то што постоји недостатак учешћа једних стејкхолдеров. Успјех политика развоја туризма и њихова имплементација почиња на укључивању свих релевантних учесника. Ова студија усвојила је квалитативни истраживачки приступ у којем су кориштene методе намјере и методе узорковања „снежних грудви“ за идентификацију истраживачког узорка из истраживачке популације. Истраживачка популација укључивала

http://www.ae.ef.unibl.org/
је особље општине у дистрикту, регионалне и локалне туристичке организације, познате као туристички форуми, агенције за развој туризма и одјељења за рурално планирање и економски развој. Сходно томе, обављено је 14 полуструктурираних интервјуа са стејкхолдерима из општине дистрикта, локалних општина, туристичких организација и туристичке агенције Паркови Источног Кејпа. За анализу података кориштена је техника тематске анализе. Ова студија се фокусирала на укљученост стејкхолдера у развој и имплементацију туристичких политика у општини ОР Тамбо (ОРТДМ). Кључни налази из студије су открили да постоји недостатак сарадње стејкхолдера у развоју и имплементацији политика везаних за туризам у ОРТДМ-у.

Кључне ријечи: стејкхолдери, политике, теорија стејкхолдера, планирање туризма